Strategy Report

Engaging the private health service delivery sector through governance in mixed health systems
OBJECTIVES | We hope to cover two main objectives during today’s meeting

1. Introduce WHO’s strategy on mixed health systems governance
   Discuss how this work can amplify the impact of priority programs
   25 minutes

2. Identify potential global technical leadership projects in which to apply the WHO governance approach
   Align priority programs where there is country buy-in
   30 minutes
METHODS  |  We be using Mentimeter to hear your feedback, suggestions, and to align on potential areas of collaboration

Visit www.menti.com

Code: XX XX XX
What is your name and organization?
OPPORTUNITY | Over the years, WHO has made progress towards recognizing and engaging the private sector, but support has been siloed within internal WHO teams. A more harmonized, system-wide approach is now required

2010
Resolution WHA 63.27 adopted Strengthening the capacity of governments to constructively engage the private sector in providing essential health services

2006
Guide for national TB programs on how to engage all relevant health care providers in TB control

2015
SDG for 2030 adopted
SDG 3.8: UHC
SDG 17: Partnerships for the goals

2015
Focused document on private sector in Technical Series on Primary Health Care

2018
WHO-EMRO RC 65 Framework for Private sector engagement in the EMRO countries towards universal health coverage

Every country is starting from a different point for private sector engagement given the role of the private sector and the strength of their governance approach and systems.

**Contexts of focus for WHO**

- Overrun by poor regulated private health sector service delivery with poor quality, high costs and poor equity
- Private and public sectors working together with single payer but struggling with equity and quality
- Public sector dominated service delivery
- Private service delivery purchased by the government

**Role of the private sector service delivery**

**Strength of governance**

**RATIONALE |** WHO should support member states to evolve their governance approach to steward service delivery of both public and private providers and ensuring the best health outcomes for the population.

Private sector engagement work is prevalent across a long list of WHO units:

1. Health systems governance and financing
2. Child health and development
3. Maternal, child, and newborn health
4. Social determinants of health
5. Integrated service delivery
6. UHC2030
7. Immunization
8. Malaria
9. Tuberculosis
10. Global NCD platform
11. Be healthy, be mobile
12. And more!
Members were selected for their expertise in different elements of private sector engagement.
**WHAT** | A well-governed health system in which public and private actors collectively deliver on the realization of UHC

**HOW** | Building consensus around the means and strategies of engaging the private sector in health care service delivery
HOW

By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private Sector</th>
<th>Governance Behaviors</th>
<th>Public Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For-Profit Formal Service Delivery</td>
<td>Build Understanding</td>
<td>Public Service Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not-For-Profit Service Delivery</td>
<td>Foster Relations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For-Profit Informal Service Delivery</td>
<td>Enable Stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Align Structures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nurture Trust</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deliver Strategy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Given the heterogeneity of the private sector, different behaviors would be prioritized for different groups.

* Countries would focus on developing different behaviors relative to the maturity of their health systems and the role of the private sector. Failures and setbacks are to be expected in the process.*

** Work on private sector governance should also strengthen governance in the public sector.**

* none of the behaviors act in isolation and no hierarchy exists between the behaviors

** All stakeholders in the system – not just the government – need to drive the system

= Universal Health Coverage
**HOW** | By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population

- **USAID**
  - Private Sector Assessments (PSA) *Assessment to Action*
  - Private Sector Counts

Others have followed
- USAID/World Bank PSAs
- World Bank CPSD reports
- IFC’s market scoping

---

**Private Sector**
- For-Profit Formal Service Delivery
- Not-For-Profit Service Delivery
- For-Profit Informal Service Delivery

**Governance Behaviors**
- Build Understanding
- Foster Relations
- Enable Stakeholders
- Align Structures
- Nurture Trust
- Deliver Strategy

**Public Sector**
- Public Service Delivery

---

*Given the heterogeneity of the private sector, different behaviors would be prioritized for different groups*

*Countries would focus on developing different behaviors relative to the maturity of their health systems and the role of the private sector. Failures and setbacks are to be expected in the process.*

*Work on private sector governance should also strengthen governance in the public sector.*
**HOW |** By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population

Country Example: Myanmar

- **Private Sector**
  - For-Profit Formal Service Delivery
  - Not-For-Profit Service Delivery
  - For-Profit Informal Service Delivery

- **Governance Behaviors**
  - Build Understanding
  - Foster Relations
  - Enable Stakeholders
  - Align Structures
  - Nurture Trust
  - Deliver Strategy

- **Public Sector**
  - Public Service Delivery

*Given the heterogeneity of the private sector, different behaviors would be prioritized for different groups*

*Countries would focus on developing different behaviors relative to the maturity of their health systems and the role of the private sector. Failures and setbacks are to be expected in the process.*

*Work on private sector governance should also strengthen governance in the public sector.*
HOW | By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population

Private Sector

Governance Behaviors

Public Sector

For-Profit Formal Service Delivery

Build Understanding

Foster Relations

Not-For-Profit Service Delivery

Enable Stakeholders

Align Structures

For-Profit Informal Service Delivery

Nurture Trust

Deliver Strategy

Country Example: Uganda

Given the heterogeneity of the private sector, different behaviors would be prioritized for different groups.

Countries would focus on developing different behaviors relative to the maturity of their health systems and the role of the private sector. Failures and setbacks are to be expected in the process.*

Work on private sector governance should also strengthen governance in the public sector.**
HOW | By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population.

Country Example: Ivory Coast
HOW | By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population

Country Examples:
Private healthcare representative bodies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private Sector</th>
<th>Governance Behaviors</th>
<th>Public Sector</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For-Profit Formal Service Delivery</td>
<td>Build Understanding</td>
<td>Public Service Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not-For-Profit Service Delivery</td>
<td>Foster Relations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For-Profit Informal Service Delivery</td>
<td>Enable Stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Align Structures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nurture Trust</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deliver Strategy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Given the heterogeneity of the private sector, different behaviors would be prioritized for different groups.

Countries would focus on developing different behaviors relative to the maturity of their health systems and the role of the private sector. Failures and setbacks are to be expected in the process.*

Work on private sector governance should also strengthen governance in the public sector.**
**HOW** | By supporting the strengthening of governance behaviors to assure the private and public sector work together to drive UHC in ways that promote equity, access, quality and financial protection for the population

Country Example: Tanzania

Private Sector

- For-Profit Formal Service Delivery
- Not-For-Profit Service Delivery
- For-Profit Informal Service Delivery

Governance Behaviors

- Build Understanding
- Foster Relations
- Enable Stakeholders
- Align Structures
- Nurture Trust
- Deliver Strategy

Public Sector

- Public Service Delivery

---

*Given the heterogeneity of the private sector, different behaviors would be prioritized for different groups.*

*Countries would focus on developing different behaviors relative to the maturity of their health systems and the role of the private sector. Failures and setbacks are to be expected in the process.*

*Work on private sector governance should also strengthen governance in the public sector.*
MENTIMETER QUESTION

Which governance behavior is most relevant in your program's work?
How does this governance approach support your work?
COVID-19 presents many challenges, particularly for countries with weak governance of mixed health systems…

However, the pandemic also generates opportunities to define a new social contract between public and private sectors
PSE & COVID | We are currently in Phase 3, which involves collecting and analyzing current evidence and experience

Phase 1: Identify and frame key issues member states are facing in engaging the private health sector

Phase 2: Provide evidence based guidance and support to WHO offices and member states in real-time

Phase 3: Collect and analyze emerging evidence and experience to inform current and future private health sector service delivery governance

Cross-cutting: Disseminate and communicate guidance and key messages
COVID TOOLS | We have produced multiple guidance documents, case studies and discussion notes in support of private sector engagement during COVID-19

SUPPORTING PRIVATE SECTOR ENGAGEMENT DURING COVID-19: WHO’S APPROACH

David Clarke is a senior health system advisor at WHO HQ in Geneva. David works in these main areas: using law and regulation to implement Universal Health Coverage (UHC), supporting countries in strategically engage the private sector in service of UHC and developing preventative approaches to mitigate the risk of health system corruption.

The COVID-19 pandemic is overwhelming health systems across the world. The need to effectively address this surge in healthcare demand has forced innovations of health to look beyond the public health service delivery system, to the private health sector. Countries with a prevailing mechanism of private sector engagement were able to do this more efficiently than those without established mechanisms of engagement. Both can benefit from central, harmonized, tailored guidance to effectively work with the private sector during the COVID-19 crisis. Private health providers too are looking for ways to contribute but are not well positioned to work effectively with the government.

TOWARDS A WHOLE SYSTEM APPROACH FOR MEETING HEALTH NEEDS IN THE TIME OF COVID-19

Geraldo Bloom is a member of the WHO Advisory Group on the Governance of the Private Sector for UHC.

Many low and middle-income countries (LMICs) have mixed health systems in which people seek care from different types of public and private healthcare providers. Although most governments have made commitments to progress towards the sustainable development goals of universal health coverage (UHC), public and private health systems have operated in parallel with little effort to govern or influence both. There is an increasing recognition that this will need to change if UHC commitments are to be achieved.

ENABLING THE PRIVATE HEALTH SECTOR IN THE NATIONAL RESPONSE TO COVID-19: SIX CURRENT POLICY CHALLENGES

Barbara O’Hanlon and Mark Hefflowell

May 2020

THE SHIP TO DIGITAL HEALTH HAS SAILED, ARE WE READY TO STEER IT IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION?

Mitala Hulter is a member of the WHO Advisory Group on the Governance of the Private Sector for UHC.

COVID-19 has catalyzed digital health technologies in a range of contexts, including low and middle-income countries (LMICs). There have been in response to the overwhelming demand placed on health systems by surges in COVID-19 cases, and the promotion of home-based care to reduce transmission through hospital visits. This has demanded behavior change from patients and physicians alike as technologies have substituted for more traditional care pathways. Governments have raced regulations on the use of such tools, including third-party apps for telehealth communication. Insurance bodies have also been compelled to find ways to reimburse digital health services. On the demand side, patients have embraced self-care apps as a means to safely meet their healthcare needs.

OPTIONS HOW TO ENGAGE THE PRIVATE HEALTH SECTOR TO TACKLE COVID-19

Barbara O’Hanlon and Venkat Raman

June 2020


By Robinah Kalilimba, Executive Director of Uganda National Health Consumers’ Organisation (UNHCO) and member of the WHO Advisory Group on the Governance of the Private Sector for Universal Health Coverage.

13 July 2020
ACTA A ACCELERATOR PRIVATE SECTOR GROUP | A global collaboration to accelerate development, production, and equitable access to COVID-19 tests, treatments, and vaccines
STRATEGIC OPPORTUNITIES | To catalyze strategic action, four main priorities are put forward by the Advisory Group to the WHO

Convene to build political will
Use WHO’s convening power to build political will for governance of mixed health systems

Embed governance behaviors
Embed the six governance behaviors by defining clear roles and responsibilities to take the work forward

Set norms and assure accountability
Set global norms – rules and policy – around the governance of mixed health systems.

Support learning and technical guidance
Set the agenda on learning and ensure that technical guidance is aligned with the governance behaviors.
To catalyze strategic action, four main priorities are put forward by the Advisory Group to the WHO:

1. **Convene to build political will**
   - WHO must use its convening power to build political will to support governance of mixed health systems including the private sector.

2. Become part of the network of partners with whom WHO works to build political will for governance of the private sector in mixed health systems.
STRATEGIC OPPORTUNITIES | To catalyze strategic action, four main priorities are put forward by the Advisory Group to the WHO

- **Embed governance behaviors**
  
  WHO works to institutionalize the governance behaviors by defining clear roles and responsibilities for the work.

- Become part of the cadre of private sector engagement specialists at the country and regional level.
To catalyze strategic action, four main priorities are put forward by the Advisory Group to the WHO:

**Set norms and assure accountability**

WHO needs to set global norms – rules and policy – around the governance of mixed health systems and set global indicators to support the monitoring of progress to assure accountability.

Support the development of implementation plans and set indicators of good practice for governance of mixed health systems.
STRATEGIC OPPORTUNITIES | To catalyze strategic action, four main priorities are put forward by the Advisory Group to the WHO

Support learning and technical guidance

WHO must set the agenda on learning around governance of mixed health systems and ensure that technical guidance is of high quality and aligned with the governance behaviors.

Support learning on good practices and success/failure stories between regions.

Assure the quality of tools, policy and technical assistance developed to support governance of the private sector.
METHODS  |  We are using Mentimeter to hear your feedback, suggestions, and to align on potential areas of collaboration.

Visit www.menti.com

Code: XX XX XX
How can WHO best support you in your advocacy for private sector engagement?

Convene to build political will
MENTIMETER QUESTION #2

Embed governance behaviors

Are there in-country opportunities to implement this strategy within your program?

Please indicate the country and the USAID program in your response.
MENTIMETER QUESTION #3

Set norms and assure accountability

Are there opportunities collect country and regional level data in your program?

*Please indicate the country and the USAID program in your response.*
MENTIMETER QUESTION #4

Support learning and technical guidance

What “hot” topics do you think are important to include on a global learning agenda on mixed health systems governance?
Questions | Observations
Please contact us if you want to discuss collaboration or want to pursue any of these strategic areas.

✉️ katherine@impactforhealth.com
Resources

Engage with the co-chairs:

- Senait: skebede55gmail.com
- Catherine: Catherine_Clarence@abtassoc.com
- Olamide: ofolorunso@unicef.org

Subgroup information, recordings and presentations from previous webinars are available on the subgroup page of the Child Health Task Force website: www.childhealthtaskforce.org/subgroups/private-sector

*The recording and presentations from this webinar will be available on this page later today

Become a member of the Child Health Task Force: www.childhealthtaskforce.org/subscribe

Check out the Task Force Child Health & COVID-19 web page for additional resources!

Suggestions for improvement or additional resources are welcome. Please email childhealthtaskforce@jsi.com.