Integrating the Private Sector into National Child Health Programs and Reporting
Session One: Lessons from Ethiopia

8 September, 2022
Webinar Series

• **Session One:** Lessons from Ethiopia in Delivering Quality Child Health Services and Data Reporting by the Private Sector

• **Session Two:** The importance of incentivizing private sector reporting into HMIS for child health – Ghana case study

• **Session Three:** Quality of care for private sector facilities delivering child health services – case study TBD

Co-hosted by the Private Sector Engagement, Monitoring and Evaluation and Quality of Care subgroups
Today’s Speakers

Dr. Maraki Fikre Merid
Private Sector Engagement Consultant
CHS Advisory

Dr. Awoke Misganaw Temesgen
Country lead
Burden of Disease Collaborative EPHI-IHME Initiative
Senior Researcher and Advisor
National Data Management Center Ethiopia Public Health Institute
Private Sector Engagement and HMIS Reporting

Case Study: Ethiopia

by
Maraki Fikre Merid, PhD, MPH

September 8, 2022
Table of Contents

1. Setting The Stage: Why is PS data reporting in HIS important and what are key pillars [Dr Maraki - 5mins]

2. Ethiopia’s experience with PS HIS reporting from a Gov Perspective [Dr Awoke – 15 mins]

1. Ethiopia – Challenges & Reflections/Opportunities [Dr. Maraki – 10 Mins]
Setting the Stage:

Why is Private Sector In Health Data Important?

[Dr. Maraki Merid]
Most Health care systems are mixed Health care systems

More than 55% of health services in Africa are delivered in Private sector

DHIS data indicate that low as well as high income groups switch between Private and Public sector

Private Sector data is the first foundation for structuring Private Sector Engagement
In Ethiopia, although public sector is dominant, PS owns and manages a wide range of health facilities across all levels of care

The private health sector owns and manages a wide range of health facilities offering diverse health services products.

The private health sector is present across all levels of care.

Private for-profit providers mostly serve high- and middle-income groups in urban areas.....but they also serve the poor.

The FMOH subsidize the middle-and upper-income groups who can afford to pay for healthcare in the private sector.
Ethiopia: Private Sector Role Depends on Type of Health Service ....

Use of private health across selected health services

- Institutional Delivery: 83% Public, 12% Private, 5% Other
- Antenatal Care Visits: 92% Public, 8% Private, 0% Other
- Treatment for children with fever/cough: 64% Public, 34% Private, 2% Other
- Treatment for children with diarrhea: 68% Public, 30% Private, 2% Other
- Modern Family Planning: 85% Public, 14% Private, 0% Other
- Long Acting Permanent Methods: 95% Public, 5% Private, 0% Other

EDHS, 2016. Note: Please note that categories may not add up to exactly 100% due to rounding errors

- FMOH is the primary health provider for all types of health services
- Greater use of private providers for childhood illnesses and modern family planning
- Opportunity to harness private sector in these health areas as well as expand access through the private sector in other health areas such as maternity services
The private health sector is an important source to treat childhood illnesses: 1/3 children with diarrhea and/or fever are treated by a private provider.

Mothers with sick children seek treatment from frontline providers - pharmacists and drug sellers.

The private sector is also an important source of locally manufactured products needed for child health - bed nets, ORS, zinc, nutritional supplements.

The poor rely more on public services compared to the wealthy.
HMIS is the foundation for effective oversight but yet few countries have galvanized routine reporting from private sector.

Diagnose  Assess  Design  Implement  Measure

Pathway processes are inclusive and consultative throughout

Data underpins every phase in the process including public-private dialogue and consultation
What do you want the private health sector to do in Ethiopia?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPTIONS</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grow</td>
<td>Govt. encourages the private health sector to expand to increase access and/or size of overall health sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harness</td>
<td>Govt. channels private health sector activities to perform specific activities / functions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer</td>
<td>Govt. shifts from delivering to purchasing services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Govt. transfers delivery to private health sector</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Prerequisites to any of these strategies**
- Knowledge on the private health sector role in health
- On-going dialogue between public and private stakeholders; and
- Strategic use of policy instruments to shape the private sector role

Dev Partners have provided for frameworks to effectively engage Governance and Public Private Dialogue and Trust is the first foundational element for better stewardship.

Figure 2. A framework to assess and enable private sector reporting

**Governance & Partnership**
- What policies govern, incentivize, and/or enforce private sector reporting?
- Which types of private providers are formally represented in the national HMIS?
- Is there a representative body or unified voice for the private sector?
- Is the private sector engaged in HMIS decision making?
- Is there an actionable roadmap for private sector inclusion in the national HMIS?

**System Readiness**
- Is there a current master facility list that includes private facilities?
- Are health indicators aligned across public and private stakeholders?
- Is the national HMIS configured to receive and reflect electronic private sector data?

**Implementation**
- Do private providers have the tools and resources to report routinely?
- How can the time and cost burden of reporting be mitigated?
- Are there mechanisms to provide relevant data to private sector providers?
Several governments engage private sector but simplistically.
Reasons why to change “old” thinking about the private health sector

- Unable to **achieve UHC** without involving all stakeholders
- No longer a question of public vs. private
- What is the **best and most efficient mix** given the context
- Quality can be variable in both private sector and public sectors
- Health outcomes vary by sector
- **Strategies needed to influence quality in both groups** to improve care delivery and outcomes for all (but particularly the poor)
- Govt. may have insufficient capacity to deliver services to entire populations... private sector can complement/add to govt efforts
Case Study: Ethiopia

Perspectives of Government and Availability and Use of PS data in HIS

Dr Awoke
Integrating the Private Sector into National Child Health Programs and Reporting: The perspective of data system and evidence generation

Awoke Misganaw (PhD)
Country Lead, EPHI-IHME collaborative burden of disease initiative
Senior Researcher and Advisor, National Data Management and Analytics Center (NDMC), EPHI
Clinical Assistant Professor of Health Metrics Science, University of Washington
Objectives of the session

• To highlight the relevance of integrating private sectors data on child health services in the national health data system for reliable evidence driven decision making

• To share Ethiopia’s experience on national data management system focusing on child health data repository, analysis and translating evidence to decision making

• To highlight implementation challenges and future directions on integrating private sector data and data system
Background about NDMC, EPHI

Data Access and Sharing with multiple data sources

National Data Management Center, EPHI

National Data Sharing Policy

Data Sources
- Census, DHS, Welfare Mon
- Death, birth, marriage
- Evaluations, NCDs, TB, HIV, malaria
- Behavioral, evaluation, Journals
- Mortality, Morbid, socio-demog.
- Clinical on TB, NTDS
- Mortality, Morbid, socio-demo
- Biomedical Evaluation, Epidemiological
- NCDs, Maternal, Neonatal, Evaluation

Agencies /Institutes/Sectors
- Ethiopia CSA
- Ethiopia VERA
- Researchers
- Local professional associations
- Local universities (HDSS)
- Ethiopia AHR
- Country office: WHO, UNICEF
- Country office: CDC, USAID
- Private Institutes
Data Repository Unit: continuously map and archive data from multiple data sources

- Currently > 450 datasets
- Data sharing for a more open research landscape, improved research integrity, innovation and discovery
1. Data archiving
2. Datasets with metadata
3. Data catalogue by keywords
4. Automated data sharing and access
5. Tracking ongoing surveys/researches

Link: https://rtds.ephi.gov.et/public/
Contains four chapters

Chapter 1: Mortality and fertility dynamics
   - Adult mortality
   - Total Fertility
   - Socio-demographic Index

Chapter 2: Causes of morbidity and mortality
   - Causes of death
   - Causes of premature mortality
   - Causes of morbidity/disability
Chapter 3: Risk factor attributable mortality and disability

- Child and maternal malnutrition
- Air pollution
- Unsafe water, Sanitation and Handwashing
- Dietary Risk
- High systolic blood pressure

Chapter 4: Life Expectancy

- Life Expectancy at birth
- Healthy Life expectancy

HSTP key indicators
Source: https://ndmc.ephi.gov.et/health-atlas/
Use of data in policy

Essential Health Services Package of Ethiopia

November 2019
Mekelle Meda
Addis Ababa

National Non-Communicable Diseases and Injuries Commission of Ethiopia:

Findings and Recommendations
Final Report

Ethiopian Public Health Institute
Current evidence support

“health in all policy” and

“National health insurance package” development
Use of data in policy

Evidence briefs (40+)

Evaluating national health expenditure with disease burden

- Triangulating health expenditure with disease burden estimates will give insight whether national health system resources have been spent in line with disease burden priority of the country.
- The purpose of this evidence brief is to evaluate the alignment of Ethiopia's health expenditure (NHM 2013/14 and 2016/17) with the burden of disease estimates to inform resource mobilization strategies of the health care system in cognizant with epidemiologic transitions in Ethiopia.
- National Health Account (NHA) and Global Burden of Diseases, Injuries, and Risk Factors Study (GBD 2019) were mapped in this brief by reclassifying NHA diseases categories to the broader GBD categories communicable, maternal, neonatal and nutritional disorders (CMNN), non-communicable disease (NCDs), and injuries.

Key Finding
- CMNN diseases have the highest disease burden and highest total health expenditure compared with NCDs and injuries in both
- The health spending share by source of funding showed that CMNN disease were having high priority with households and donors.

The burden of lower respiratory infections and associated risk factors

Lower respiratory infections (LRIs) include diseases of the lower airways, such as bronchitis, pneumonia, and bronchiolitis mainly affecting children.
LRIs have a significant impact on the morbidity and mortality rates in Ethiopia.

This evidence brief presents the burden and trends of LRIs in national and regional states of Ethiopia between 1990 and 2019 using the metrics in the Global Burden of Diseases Study (GBD 2019).
Challenges and strategies

Limited private sector data system integration in this platforms
Challenges and strategies

Quality of data???
Challenges and strategies

National Data Week (March 14-18, 2022)

B/Gumuz

Federal

Gambella

Addis Ababa
Future Directions

- Health sector policy and strategies supports the integration of private sector that includes data but there are implementation challenges
- There is a need to develop implementation guidelines and standards, create strong collaboration with private sectors, implement systems such as DHIS-2 and monitoring the data quality
- Promote data exchange, monitor and strengthen evidence informed private child health care interventions
Thank you!
CHALLENGES & REFLECTIONS

How can Ethiopia strategically engage with private sector in health in HIS and Data reporting?

[Dr. Maraki Merid]
Ethiopia PSA identified Key data challenges encountered -

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Weak</th>
<th>Moderate</th>
<th>Strong</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human resources</strong></td>
<td><strong>Facilities</strong></td>
<td><strong>National health accounts</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Incomplete (do not track private sector HRH)</td>
<td>• Classification not comparable</td>
<td>• Consistently present public-private mix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Out-of-date</td>
<td>• Private sector data:</td>
<td>• Definition varies from year to year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Classification not comparable</td>
<td>- Scarce,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Total # private sector HR underreported</td>
<td>- Fragmented</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Large # not licensed</td>
<td>- Limited</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Medical Training Institutes</strong></td>
<td><strong>Pharma</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Out-of-date</td>
<td>• Good data on private pharmacies, incomplete public</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Large # not licensed</td>
<td>• But data decentralized</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Incomplete (no data on mfg., importers, distributors)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MOH reporting</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inconsistent reporting on public-private data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inconsistent definition of private sector MOH reports</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Barrier: Incomplete data but with recent initiatives to improve

- **No standard definition:** Understanding of private sector is mainly limited to the “for profit” entities and no standard definition is applied across the MOH;
- **Inconsistent reporting:** Private sector data reporting not consistent from one report to another or across time (e.g. sometimes detailed for NGO and recently not);
- **Data is fragmented:** Licensing authority has some private sector data, all regional health bureaus capture other private sector data, while others believe it is policy and planning department’s responsibility to collect data; details not consolidated to level of FMOH;
- **Data quality:** Data is relatively scarce (at least in reporting even if available) for private sector and deemed questionable (for both public and private sector);
- **Data systems out-of-date:** Facility licensing, HRH certification and CPD are all paper-based (new initiative to digitalize and integrate);
- **Limited capacity:** MOH has limited capacity to collect and interpret data on private sector;
- **Low priority given limited resources:** Generally low priority given to investing resources to collect private sector data in ongoing projects (e.g. master GPS, registry of all health professionals, cost data on public and private health services, etc.);
- **Under-reporting:** Difficulties in engaging private sector to report to HMIS due to fears of taxation, sanctions or closures; also MOH reporting requirements are cumbersome;
- **New initiatives:** The related data MOH directorates have organized platforms to “dialogue” and engage private sector on HMIS; there is a new information system integration effort.

"... We do need private sector data to better understand the health situation in our country and even if we have to force them to give us. And we will!! We do no know who they are and how to get in touch with them...too many associations and not representative..."
Barrier: Lack of trust due to limited engagement but promising initiatives

- **Limited capacity of existing mechanism(s) as a platform for PPD:** FMOH dialogues with private sector in various forums but no mechanism that address sector-wide issues. MOH making efforts to address gaps.

- **Fragmentation:** Private sector is still fragmented but formed nascent private sector umbrella organization; still struggling to be representative.

- **Ad hoc engagement:** Irregular consultation (although improving recently); inviting the private sector is sometimes last minute or completely forgotten; engagement is based on personal relationships and level varies across MOH department.

- **Prejudicial perceptions of each other:** FMOH considers that “private sector is only motivated by money” while private sector thinks “public sector is motivated by position, power and control”. These opinions, if not addressed, will maintain the divide.

- **New initiatives on both sides:** MOH committed to strengthen public private dialogue. MOH established an interim dialogue structure and private sector formed an umbrella body. Key MOH departments holding monthly meetings with related private sector stakeholders to engage them on new policies and strategies.

“We do not know how to find the private sector and vice versa. There is no point person for the FMOH...it is mostly through individual relations and contacts.

“Very difficult to engage them (private sector)...we even forget to include them.

“I believe both parties have to try harder...we cannot blame one side or other for lack of dialogue”
ETHIOPIA: Challenges Identified for PSE and HIS data reporting

- **No common vision of challenges in the health sector** => Public and Private sector need to work together to identify solutions that are priority - *The COVID 19 example showcases the feasibility of such alignment*

- **Under reporting: Barriers** reported are
  - Fears of taxation, sanctions and closures
  - Cumbersome MOH reporting requirements (too many indicators etc.)
  - Expensive for small clinics and pharmacies as need to retain staff to do the reporting
  - Private sector data not included in MOH report and not shared with PS
ETHIOPIA: MOH Initiatives to respond to identified challenges

- **The MOH Policy and Planning Directorate** has organized a platform to engage the private sector on increasing reporting to the HMIS;

- **The MOH Health IT Directorate** is procuring IT services to digitize MOH paper files and to create a web-based platform integrating the different data systems;

- The MOH Health IT Directorate will include all private health facilities by the end of this year in the **Master Facility list** and

- The MOH Human Resource and National Health Professionals Competency Assessment and Licensure Directorates are creating a registry of all – including private sector - health professionals. Even though the MOH acknowledge the need to collect data on the private health sector, many public stakeholders interviewed stated they would like assistance to better understand what data is critical for key MOH policy and planning functions as well as routine MOH reports to reflect the private sector contribution in health.
ETHIOPIA: Opportunities to Strengthen Data reporting, collection and analysis

- **Review MOH data requirements on private health sector** (e.g. licensing, quality, DHIS, etc.) to develop comprehensive list of government data needs and assess level of private sector reporting;

- **Conduct series of consultative meetings** with the private health sector to understand reasons for underreporting and co-develop a strategy to address these concerns;

- Use the consultative meetings to **agree on basic set of core indicators** that the private health sector is willing to routinely report on and strategies to facilitate reporting; and

- Identify MOH and private sector champions to help increase private sector reporting

- Include private sector representatives in data analysis and dissemination
Data underpins every phase in the process including public-private dialogue and consultation

**MOHS Policymakers**
- Informs dialogue
- Strengthens policy/planning and implementation
- Enhances stewardship and oversight capacity
- Rationalizes investments and partnerships

**Private Health Businesses in Ethiopia**
- Acknowledges private sector contribution
- Sends market signals (e.g. MOHS directions, investment priorities)
- Provides important market information

**Local and International Investors**
- Sends market signals
- Provides important market information
- Facilitates investment
What is role of Policymaker with private sector data?

What can you do to improve data collection on the private sector?
- Understand the data on the private health sector
- Share the private health sector data with your team
- Facilitate your team’s capacity in collecting and analyzing private health data
- Champion strategies to improve data collection and strengthen analysis

How can you use private health sector data?
- To improve sector-wide policy in your directorates
- To strengthen planning (e.g. avoid duplication, increase efficiency and improve coordination of resources)
- To inform day-to-day decisions
- To accelerate achievement of UHC through strategic partnerships
Success will look like….

To achieve success, each sector is empowered to play their respective role

- **Govt. actively engages the private health sector (PPD)**
  - Systems established place to govern, incentivize and partner with the PS
  - Govt. staff with higher technical capacity to engage the PS and manage PPD
  - Policies and incentives in place (with input from PS) to grow and harness the PS
  - Govt. uses wide range of policy/HF instruments and partnerships models

- **PS actively collaborates and partners with the public sector**
  - PS is organized and speaks with one voice
  - PS enthusiastically participates in policy and planning
  - PS seeks to partner with govt. in varies types of PPPs
  - PS invests in health sector for improving services for patients with various levels of income
The government worked with the private sector to compliment Ministries efforts to treat acute pediatric diarrhea. The Ministry focused on front line providers in communities such as private pharmacists, drug retailers and over the counter medical sellers (OTCMS). With USAID’s assistance, the Ministry, in partnership with the Ghana Pharmacy Council, trained the frontline providers in treatment guidelines for acute diarrhea. They also trained private providers such as doctors, nurses and midwives in the new diarrhea protocols.

The Ministry reinforced knowledge through supportive supervision and text messaging. To ensure a sustained supply of quality, affordable ORS and Zinc, the Ministry partnered with M&G Pharmaceuticals to manufacture locally and distribute the zinc product - ZINTAB. Finally, the Ministry carried out extensive IEC campaigns to educate consumers about diarrhea treatment and ZINC.
Promising Approach to Modernize Regulatory Systems-Uganda Example of Social Regulations Tools of Government to GROW the Private Health Sector

The four health professional councils, with support from USAID, are updating and modernizing professional certification and facility licensure using technology. The Councils have created a web-based platform that enables all healthcare professionals to reapply and pay for their professional certification and for private businesses to apply for facility licenses. The new system will:

• Develop a single, uniform application and process to be used by all Councils
• Collect consistent and standardized information that clearly delineates public, private-for-profit and not-for-profit and dual practices among professionals and facilities
• Centralize all data collection and reporting
• Align and apply MOH facility classification across all sectors, and
• Streamline facility inspection using a web-based tool.

In addition, the councils are developing a single, universal tool common to all councils and regulatory authorities to inspect facilities. The linked continuous professional development (CPD) hours to clinical standards and developed a system to track and issue CPD hours.

In addition, the Ministry of Health and private sector developed a self-regulatory quality tool. It is a simple web-based tool that can be self-administered by private facilities. The tool gives a quality “score” that can be ranked with other facilities. The MOH and Councils approved the tool and it is now a requirement for professional certification and facility licensure. The Uganda Healthcare Federation is training its member associations to use the tool while the Ministry is training its District Health Officers to apply SQIS and other tools with private providers and facilities.
Connect with the us

Engage with the **QoC subgroup co-chairs:**
- Anne: adetjen@unicef.org
- Patty: pjodrey@usaid.gov
- Peter: pwaiswa@musph.ac.ug

Engage with the **PSE subgroup co-chairs:**
- Amit: abhanot@fhm-engage.org
- Joseph: jaddo-yobo@tfhoghana.org
- Senait: skebed4@emory.edu

Engage with the **M&E subgroup co-chairs:**
- Debra: Debra.Jackson@lshtm.ac.uk
- Kate: kate_gilroy@jsi.com

Access webinar recordings and presentations (including this series) here: [www.childhealthtaskforce.org/events](http://www.childhealthtaskforce.org/events)


Follow us on LinkedIn: [www.linkedin.com/company/child-health-task-force](http://www.linkedin.com/company/child-health-task-force)
The Child Health Task Force is managed by JSI Research & Training Institute, Inc. through the USAID Advancing Nutrition project and funded by USAID and the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation.

This presentation was made possible by the generous support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), under the terms of the Contract 7200AA18C00070 awarded to JSI Research & Training Institute, Inc. The contents are the responsibility of JSI and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the U.S. Government.